

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC211995P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Firm Name	Derrick Chan	Barney McCoy	Darby Delsalle	Natacha Yacinthe	William Castillo	Total	Ranking (before appl. of LP/Tie Breaker)	Local/Non-Local Preference*	5% Range	Ranking (after appl. of LP/Tie Breaker)
CDM Smith, Inc.	88	90	95	95	91	459	1	Non-local	22.95 (436 total points)	4
CTS Engineering, Inc.	84	85	99	99	80	447	2 (Tie)	Local	Eligible for LP	2
H.W. Lochner, Inc.	82	75	95	90	75	417	6	Non-local		7
Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	85	80	94	94	84	437	3	Local	Eligible for LP	3
Kittelton & Associates, Inc.	78	75	91	95	73	412	7	Non-local		8
The Corradino Group, Inc.	79	77	91	90	73	410	8	Local		9
Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	80	83	92	92	77	424	5	Non-local		6
Whitehouse Group, Inc.	84	75	98	93	78	428	4	Local**		5
WSP USA, Inc.	87	88	94	95	83	447	2 (Tie)	Local	Eligible for LP	1

TIE BREAKER CRITERIA

1. Vendor located within Broward County as set forth in Subsection 21.31.c.
2. Vendor which provides domestic partner benefits.
3. Vendor that has the lowest dollar volume of work, calculated by payments to vendor, by County over a five (5) year period from the date of the submittal.
4. A re-vote or re-assessment of only the tied vendors.
5. Preference to vendor receiving a majority of the total first-place votes.

PREFERENCE FOR LOCAL VENDORS - RFP's

For all other competitive solicitations in which objective factors used to evaluate the responses from vendors are assigned point totals, if, upon the completion of final rankings (technical and price combined, if applicable) by the Evaluation Committee, a non-local business is the highest ranked proposer and the ranking of a local proposer is **within five percent (5%)** of the ranking obtained by the non-local proposer, the highest-ranked local proposer shall have the opportunity to proceed to negotiations with the County.

***Note:** Refer to the Director of Purchasing Memorandum, attached Responsiveness and Responsibility Matrix, Section C.7. (Additional Requirements/Information , Local Preference) for application of local preference (LP) based on the firm's eligibility for preference under the LP Ordinance.

Refer to additional Scoring Summary - Tie Breaker for breaking the tie between two firms.

****Scrivener error:** Whitehouse Group, Inc. was initially listed on scoring summary sheet as "Non-Local" (at Final EC Meeting), however the firm was determined to be "Local" for Location Points and Local Preference, but was not eligible for Location Tie Breaker due to its local business tax receipt not being submitted with initial submittal (as recapped in Director of Purchasing's Memorandum dated May 7, 2020). There is no change in points, ranking, or tie breaker application due to this correction.

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC2119955P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Evaluation Criteria (Complete text of questions provided separately)	Maximum Points	CDM Smith, Inc.	CTS Engineering, Inc.	H.W. Lochner, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	The Corradino Group, Inc.	Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	Whitehouse Group, Inc.	WSP USA, Inc.
1. ABILITY OF PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.a	10	9	7	8	9	8	7	7	7	8
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.b	10	9	8	9	8	8	9	8	8	9
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.c	10	9	8	8	8	8	8	8	8	9
2. Project Approach: (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.a	20	19	17	17	18	16	16	17	17	19
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.b	5	4	4	4	5	4	4	4	4	4
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.c	5	5	4	5	4	4	4	4	5	5
3. PAST PERFORMANCE (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.a	15	14	13	14	14	13	13	14	13	14
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.b	15	14	14	13	14	13	13	14	13	14
4. Workload of the Firm (Total Max 5 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 4	5	5	4	4	5	4	5	4	4	5
5. Location (Total Max 5 Points)		POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING
See Evaluation Criteria - question 5	5	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	0
		TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING
TOTAL SCORE WILL BE ENTERED BY PURCHASING	Max 100 One Hundred	88	84	82	85	78	79	80	84	87

Derrick Chan	
Name:	By completing this document, I certify that I have abided by the Cone of Silence Ordinance and have not been influenced or coerced by anyone in the assignment of the points by me for this procurement. Additionally, by entering my scores on this document, I certify that that the scores contained herein have been electronically submitted by me to Purchasing for tabulation during this virtual meeting.
STAFF ELECTRONIC SCORE SHEET FOR CALCULATING	

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC2119955P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Evaluation Criteria (Complete text of questions provided separately)	Maximum Points	CDM Smith, Inc.	CTS Engineering, Inc.	H.W. Lochner, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	The Corradino Group, Inc.	Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	Whitehouse Group, Inc.	WSP USA, Inc.
1. ABILITY OF PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.a	10	9	8	8	8	9	9	9	8	9
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.b	10	9	8	8	8	9	9	8	8	9
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.c	10	9	8	8	8	9	9	8	8	9
2. Project Approach: (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.a	20	20	16	17	16	14	15	15	13	19
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.b	5	5	4	3	4	4	5	4	4	5
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.c	5	5	4	3	4	4	4	4	4	4
3. PAST PERFORMANCE (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.a	15	14	13	12	14	11	11	15	10	14
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.b	15	14	14	12	14	11	11	15	11	14
4. Workload of the Firm (Total Max 5 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 4	5	5	5	4	4	4	4	5	4	5
5. Location (Total Max 5 Points)		POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING
See Evaluation Criteria - question 5	5	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	0
		TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING
TOTAL SCORE WILL BE ENTERED BY PURCHASING	Max 100 One Hundred	90	85	75	80	75	77	83	75	88

Barney McCoy	By completing this document, I certify that I have abided by the Cone of Silence Ordinance and have not been influenced or coerced by anyone in the assignment of the points by me for this procurement. Additionally, by entering my scores on this document, I certify that that the scores contained herein have been electronically submitted by me to Purchasing for tabulation during this virtual meeting.
Name:	
STAFF ELECTRONIC SCORE SHEET FOR CALCULATING	

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC2119955P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Evaluation Criteria (Complete text of questions provided separately)	Maximum Points	CDM Smith, Inc.	CTS Engineering, Inc.	H.W. Lochner, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	The Corradino Group, Inc.	Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	Whitehouse Group, Inc.	WSP USA, Inc.
1. ABILITY OF PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.a	10	10	10	10	10	10	9	10	10	10
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.b	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.c	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10	10
2. Project Approach: (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.a	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20	20
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.b	5	5	5	5	4	4	4	5	5	5
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.c	5	5	5	5	5	3	3	3	3	4
3. PAST PERFORMANCE (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.a	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.b	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
4. Workload of the Firm (Total Max 5 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 4	5	5	4	5	5	4	5	4	5	5
5. Location (Total Max 5 Points)		POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING
See Evaluation Criteria - question 5	5	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	0
		TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING
TOTAL SCORE WILL BE ENTERED BY PURCHASING	Max 100 One Hundred	95	99	95	94	91	91	92	98	94

Darby Delsalle	By completing this document, I certify that I have abided by the Cone of Silence Ordinance and have not been influenced or coerced by anyone in the assignment of the points by me for this procurement. Additionally, by entering my scores on this document, I certify that that the scores contained herein have been electronically submitted by me to Purchasing for tabulation during this virtual meeting.
Name:	
STAFF ELECTRONIC SCORE SHEET FOR CALCULATING	

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC2119955P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Evaluation Criteria (Complete text of questions provided separately)	Maximum Points	CDM Smith, Inc.	CTS Engineering, Inc.	H.W. Lochner, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	The Corradino Group, Inc.	Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	Whitehouse Group, Inc.	WSP USA, Inc.
1. ABILITY OF PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.a	10	10	10	9	10	10	10	9	10	10
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.b	10	10	9	9	9	10	8	9	9	10
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.c	10	10	10	9	10	10	9	9	8	10
2. Project Approach: (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.a	20	20	20	18	20	20	18	20	18	20
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.b	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.c	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3. PAST PERFORMANCE (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.a	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.b	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15	15
4. Workload of the Firm (Total Max 5 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	3	5
5. Location (Total Max 5 Points)		POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING
See Evaluation Criteria - question 5	5	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	0
		TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING
TOTAL SCORE WILL BE ENTERED BY PURCHASING	Max 100 One Hundred	95	99	90	94	95	90	92	93	95

Natacha Yacinthe	By completing this document, I certify that I have abided by the Cone of Silence Ordinance and have not been influenced or coerced by anyone in the assignment of the points by me for this procurement. Additionally, by entering my scores on this document, I certify that that the scores contained herein have been electronically submitted by me to Purchasing for tabulation during this virtual meeting.
Name:	
STAFF ELECTRONIC SCORE SHEET FOR CALCULATING	

Scoring Sheet
Final Evaluation Meeting
RFP No. PNC2119955P1
General Planning Consultant Services for the Transportation Department
June 3 - 4, 2020

Evaluation Criteria (Complete text of questions provided separately)	Maximum Points	CDM Smith, Inc.	CTS Engineering, Inc.	H.W. Lochner, Inc.	Kimley-Horn and Associates, Inc.	Kittelson & Associates, Inc.	The Corradino Group, Inc.	Tindale-Oliver & Associates, Inc.	Whitehouse Group, Inc.	WSP USA, Inc.
1. ABILITY OF PROFESSIONAL PERSONNEL (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.a	10	10	8	8	9	8	8	8	8	9
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.b	10	10	8	8	9	8	8	9	7	8
See Evaluation Criteria - question 1.c	10	10	8	7	9	7	7	8	7	9
2. Project Approach: (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.a	20	19	15	16	17	15	15	16	15	17
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.b	5	4	4	4	4	3	3	4	4	4
See Evaluation Criteria - question 2.c	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
3. PAST PERFORMANCE (Total Max 30 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.a	15	14	11	11	13	11	11	11	11	13
See Evaluation Criteria - question 3.b	15	14	11	11	13	11	11	11	11	13
4. Workload of the Firm (Total Max 5 Points)										
See Evaluation Criteria - question 4	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5	5
5. Location (Total Max 5 Points)		POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING	POINTS ENTERED BY PURCHASING
See Evaluation Criteria - question 5	5	0	5	0	0	0	0	0	5	0
		TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING	TOTAL SCORE CALCULATED BY PURCHASING
TOTAL SCORE WILL BE ENTERED BY PURCHASING	Max 100 One Hundred	91	80	75	84	73	73	77	78	83

William Castillo	By completing this document, I certify that I have abided by the Cone of Silence Ordinance and have not been influenced or coerced by anyone in the assignment of the points by me for this procurement. Additionally, by entering my scores on this document, I certify that that the scores contained herein have been electronically submitted by me to Purchasing for tabulation during this virtual meeting.
Name:	
STAFF ELECTRONIC SCORE SHEET FOR CALCULATING	